A Scoping Review of Life Design Intervention Research: Implications for Counselling and Psychotherapy Practice Revue exploratoire de la recherche sur l'intervention de type « life design » : implications dans l'exercice du counseling et de la psychothérapie

Bradley Lewis University of Calgary José F. Domene University of Calgary

#### ABSTRACT

The recently developed paradigm in career counselling known as life design has caused a proliferation of new interventions. A scoping study was performed to provide an overview of empirical support for the effectiveness of these interventions. Twelve articles that evaluate the efficacy of eight interventions were found. Interventions included individual and group forms of the Career Construction Interview and My Career Story. Others were group-based life design interventions, the Career Construction Genogram, an online-based life design intervention, and a classroom intervention designed for elementary children. Career adaptability was the most commonly evaluated outcome and participants were most commonly from Italy, with no study using North American participants. Experimental or quasi-experimental research designs were most frequently used, while several articles reported on case studies. The authors recommend that future research balance case studies and experimental designs and that further research should validate findings with Canadian populations. This article notes the synergistic potential of engaging with social constructionist approaches in the broader field of counselling and psychotherapy for developing new interventions.

#### RÉSUMÉ

Le récent paradigme en conseil d'orientation de carrière appelé *life design* (construire sa vie) a entraîné une multiplication de nouvelles interventions. Une étude exploratoire a été menée afin de fournir une vue d'ensemble du support empirique à l'efficacité de ces interventions. On a dégagé douze articles qui permettent d'évaluer l'efficacité de huit interventions, notamment des formes individuelles et de groupe de l'entrevue de construction de carrière et de Mon récit de parcours professionnel (*My Career Story*). Les autres étaient des interventions de groupe de type *life design*, le génogramme de construction de carrière, une intervention *life design* en ligne, et une intervention

en classe conçue pour les élèves du primaire. Le paramètre le plus couramment évalué fut l'adaptabilité du parcours professionnel, et la plupart des participants provenaient d'Italie, aucune étude n'ayant été menée auprès de participants nord-américains. Dans la plupart des cas, on a eu recours à des modèles de recherche expérimentale ou quasi expérimentale, bien que quelques articles aient rapporté des études de cas. Les auteurs ont suggéré que la recherche future rétablisse l'équilibre entre les études de cas et les modèles expérimentaux et qu'à l'avenir, la recherche devrait valider des résultats obtenus auprès de populations canadiennes. Nous avons noté le potentiel synergique associé au fait de s'aligner sur des approches sociales constructivistes dans les domaines plus larges du counseling et de la psychothérapie pour l'élaboration de nouvelles interventions.

The life design paradigm in career counselling has emerged to assist clients in undertaking the turbulent labour market of the 21st century (Hartung & Vess, 2019; Savickas, 2011a, 2012; Savickas et al., 2009). Given the contemporary career concerns of the 21st century, there has been a proliferation of new and innovative life design interventions that may be of interest to many counsellors focused on career or on a related area of practice. To our knowledge, these interventions have not been examined together and consolidated into an informative overview that identifies gaps in the research literature and that provides suggestions for future directions in research and practice of life design.

As counselling and career development continually strive to bridge apparent silos of their proliferating professional practices and areas of research, we aim to address questions that develop from their different professional positions toward life design and career counselling (Domene & Isenor, 2018; House & Feltham, 2015; Linden, 2015; Stam, 2004). We developed this article from the perspective of a student training as a general counselling psychologist and a professor conducting research in the field of career development and counselling. Given our perspectives, we are interested in providing a general counsellor's perspective on what one may need to know to understand the life design approach to career counselling.

In pursuit of these goals, this article provides a summary of the context in which the life design approach developed, followed by a description of its theoretical foundations and intervention models. To create an overview of life design interventions, a scoping review was performed and the findings are reported. Twelve research articles were found and eight distinct life design interventions were evaluated. These interventions are (1) the individual-based career construction interview (CCI), (2) the group-based CCI, (3) the individual-based My Career Story workbook (MCS), (4) the group-based MCS, (5) general group interventions, (6) the Career Construction Genogram (CCG), (7) an online intervention, and (8) a classroom intervention designed for elementary school

children. These articles demonstrate the quality of the empirical evidence toward the effectiveness of each intervention and contribute to the growing evidence for the effectiveness of the life design paradigm (McMahon, 2018). In conducting our review, we came to recognize the similarities of life design interventions to other forms of counselling outside of career counselling. We reflect on the possibility for synergy between life design and other social construction or narrative forms of counselling and call for future researchers to bridge gaps between these fields that are isolated from others internationally (Linden, 2015) and in Canada (Domene & Isenor, 2018).

## 21st-Century Career

Life design is a paradigm in career counselling that was created to help equip clients for the 21st-century labour market. The contemporary labour market is characterized by rapid change and by more unpredictability compared to that of previous generations (Hartung & Vess, 2019; Savickas et al., 2009). In the 21st century, the labour market is defined by the notion of "dejobbing" and by the "insecure worker" who can be described as taking "temporary, contingent, casual, contract, freelance, part time, external, atypical, adjunct, consultant, and self-employed" roles (Savickas, 2012, p. 13). These changes reflect a shift from developing a career within a supportive and stable market or organization to the need for individuals to construct and manage their careers without the benefit of job security (Savickas, 2011a).

# Roots of Life Design

Life design has developed from several theoretical bases in career development and counselling psychology. The general development of career counselling can be understood as consisting of three phases (Hartung, 2013; Savickas, 2011b). The first phase consisted of trait-factor or matching models in which inventories are used to evaluate characteristics of clients and to match these clients with what was perceived to be a suitable occupation (Hartung, 2013; Savickas, 2009, 2011b). In reaction to the increasing inadequacies of this matching model, Super (1957, 1990) created models of career counselling that viewed career as a lifelong project. This shift invited the second phase in the development of career counselling (Hartung, 2013; Savickas, 2011b). Super's (1957) career development theory and his subsequent life-span, life-space approach (Super, 1990) broke from traditional trait-factor models of career counselling through its attention to lifelong development and to the impact of contextual factors on an individual's career (Savickas, 1997; Super et al., 1996). Life design borrowed and expanded on this view of career as a life project that is impacted by its context.

Another influence on life design is Adlerian psychotherapy and its emphasis on meaning making, the construction of the self, and the use of lifestyle assessment and early memory stories (Hartung & Vess, 2019; Savickas, 2009). Life design also adopts a social constructionist epistemology with attention to how knowledge, meaning, and identity are constructed within social, cultural, and historical narratives and contexts (Savickas et al., 2009). Therefore, life design can be defined as a new paradigm with an original position toward career counselling and toward career in general. As life design stands as a representative, the third phase of career counselling has been referred to as a turn to narrative (Hartung, 2013).

## Life Design Model

The goal of a life design approach is to foster a clear identity and life mission in clients through the narration and authoring of their life stories (Hartung & Vess, 2019). A general life design model for career counselling consists of three phases. These phases are (a) exploring career through small stories, (b) deconstructing and reconstructing these small stories to create a larger story about career and identity, and (c) co-constructing intentions and actions for a next step in the client's career plan (Savickas, 2011a, 2012).

Through exploring small stories about career, the client and the counsellor begin to identify themes that can be used to organize these stories into a larger narrative that is meaningful in terms of the client's identity (Stoltz & Barclay, 2015). This larger story is often called a *life portrait* or a *macro-narrative* (Savickas, 2012). In the process of creating this larger overarching story, a counsellor would identify a career theme that emerges from the patterns found in small stories (Savickas, 2011a; Stoltz & Barclay, 2015). Themes are considered the unit of meaning connecting small stories into a plot (Savickas, 2011a).

Savickas (2011a) distinguished between what he calls *objective career* and *subjective career* to illustrate how this model works. An objective career refers to the sequence of occupational roles that an individual may have held from school to retirement. What makes this objective is that such a history of occupational roles is observable to anyone (Savickas, 2011a). Subjective career refers to the career identity that an individual has constructed over the history of occupational roles. Such an identity is a product of a constructed narrative of one's career life (Savickas, 2011a). Through connecting each occupational role of an objective career into a plot, the subjective career is produced (Savickas, 2011a). Following this process, clients become authors of their autobiographical narratives and find their career identity (Hartung & Vess, 2019).

Constructing a career identity is a vital component of the life design paradigm. Identity is understood as the product of an individual's understanding of themselves concerning the social roles they fill (Savickas, 2012). This means that one's identity is affected by changing social roles and relationships (Savickas, 2011a, 2012). Because identity forms are shaped by life narratives, interventions should

aid a client in re-authoring their stories when they experience a career trauma (Savickas, 2012).

Another important aspect of constructing a career identity is the fostering of clients' agency. To illustrate this development of agency, Savickas (2016) makes the distinction between reflection and reflexivity in the practice of life design. He explains that "reflection involves client self-observation while subsequent reflexivity brings about change in self based on that reflection" (Savickas, 2016, p. 84). This change is self-driven based on the client's new understandings and intentions. As authors of their own autobiographical narratives, clients become motivated agents within their career trajectory who fit work roles into their other life roles (Hartung & Vess, 2019). It is from these newly developed intentions and agency that the client and the counsellor co-construct the next steps in the client's career plan (Savickas, 2011a, 2012).

### **Model for Interventions**

Within the life design paradigm, the goals of interventions are to foster career adaptability, narratability, activity, and intentionality (Savickas et al., 2009). Career adaptability consists of the four Cs of adaptability resources. These resources "include dimensions related to concern for the future, control over decision making, curiosity to explore, and confidence to deal with barriers" (Santilli et al., 2019, p. 50). It also aims to help a client maintain a sense of continuity in their identity through narratability (Savickas et al., 2009). In this context, narratability refers to the process of assisting a client in constructing a narrative of their career and life that provides a sense of continuity and coherence (Savickas et al., 2009). Such narratives help with identifying life themes, a career identity, and resources for adaptability (Savickas, 2005; Savickas et al., 2009). Fostering activity involves helping the client identify and engage in activities to learn their abilities and interests (Savickas et al., 2009). Finally, interventions allow a client to find agency and develop intentions toward next steps (Savickas et al., 2009). To date, the three major interventions in life design are the career construction interview (Savickas, 2015), the My Career Story workbook (Savickas & Hartung, 2012), and life design groups (Barclay & Stoltz, 2016).

Given how recently the life design paradigm has developed, there has been a proliferation of interventions that, to our knowledge, have not been collected together and consolidated into an overview. Such an overview would be valuable to career counsellors who want to expand their repertoire of life design interventions or to counsellors looking for an introduction to life design in practice. Also, an overview can identify gaps in the research literature and provide suggestions for future directions in the development of life design interventions (Arksey & O'Malley, 2005).

#### Methods

A scoping review of the current state of empirical support for the effectiveness of interventions based on the life design paradigm in career counselling was conducted. This scoping study aims to provide an informative overview of such interventions for career counselling practitioners and for other counsellors interested in learning more about life design (Arksey & O'Malley, 2005).

## **Guiding Questions**

Guiding the scoping study are questions regarding what interventions exist based on the life design paradigm and what empirical studies exist that evaluate the effectiveness of these interventions. Further informative questions involve the assessed outcomes for such interventions, the populations or presenting concerns for which these interventions are validated, and the types of research methods that are used to evaluate these life design interventions.

### Procedure

Peer-reviewed research articles on life design interventions were searched for within *PsycINFO* and *ERIC*, two major databases for published research on counselling. In each database, the following combined search terms were used: "life design," "interventions," and "empirical evidence." Each term was combined using the "and" term, which restricts the search to articles that contain all three terms. Search terms alternative to empirical evidence—"efficacy," "effectiveness," "outcome," "empirical," "qualitative," "quantitative," "evidence," "impact," and "research"—were also used.

Articles were reviewed with the following inclusion criteria: each article (a) must be peer reviewed, (b) must be in English, (c) must state a specific life design intervention examined, and (d) must present an empirical study examining the effectiveness of the said intervention; articles stating a general use of a life design approach to career counselling were excluded. The review was limited to Englishlanguage publications because this is the only language in which both authors are fluent. Criteria were applied first to article titles, then to the abstract, and finally to the full article in deciding the inclusion of articles for the scoping study. An additional search was performed to capture relevant articles that may have been absent in the two searched databases. The same search terms, inclusionary/exclusionary criteria, and procedure were used in this search. Following this procedure, 12 articles were found appropriate and included for review in the scoping study.

### **Intervention Overview**

The following is an overview of research articles for each respective intervention. Each article overview offers details on the outcomes examined, populations

used to evaluate interventions, research methods, and study findings. Presenting concerns are provided only in some overviews, as many articles did not state participants' presenting concerns. Eight interventions are reported on and will be presented in the following order: (1) individual-based CCI, (2) group-based CCI, (3) individual-based MCS, (4) group-based MCS, (5) general group interventions, (6) Career Construction Genogram (CCG), (7) an online intervention, and (8) a classroom intervention designed for elementary school children.

## Individual-Based CCI

Three articles supported the effectiveness of the CCI for individual clients. Two of these articles were case studies from a single author, designed to evaluate the effectiveness of CCI for mid-career individuals from marginalized populations within South Africa (Maree, 2014, 2017). First, Maree (2014) examined the effectiveness of CCI for a mid-career lesbian woman in South Africa. The presenting concern was difficulty in making a decision about changing careers. The stated outcomes for this intervention were to foster a sense of career identity and authorship of the participant's career story. Maree (2017) also examined the effectiveness of CCI for minority populations with a specific focus on one mid-career Black male from South Africa. Similar to the client in the earlier article, this client presented with career indecision. The stated outcomes for this intervention was to assist the client in building direction and confidence in pursuing this direction. For both case studies, it was reported that clients created a sense of authorship and direction in their career narratives and successfully came to a decision about their career paths.

Di Fabio (2016) also conducted a case study designed to evaluate an outcome assessment tool for the CCI. Di Fabio's assessment tool is the Career Counselling Innovative Outcomes (CCIO) tool, which assesses several outcomes of CCI. The stated outcomes evaluated by CCIO are changes in the following categories: (a) actions taken to solve the problem, (b) reflections on the problem and possible change, (c) critical analysis and development of a new perspective on the problem, (d) a reconceptualization of career narrative, and (e) a performance of change through next steps (Di Fabio, 2016). The case study focused on an Italian biomedical engineering university student in her final year. The client presented with concerns related to the transition from school to work and completed the CCIO before and after a CCI counselling session. The CCIO revealed that the client changed in positive ways in each outcome category.

# **Group-Based CCI**

Di Fabio and Maree (2012) used an experimental design to evaluate the effectiveness of an earlier iteration of the CCI called the Career Story Interview in a group counselling context. Participants were Italian entrepreneurs in agriculture and trade sectors seeking assistance for difficulties with career

indecisions. The study compared an experimental group of persons (n = 38) who had completed the CCI and a control group of persons (n = 34) who had not. The examined outcomes were career decision making and self-efficacy. An ANOVA analyzed pre- and post-intervention scores on the Career Decision-Making Difficulties Questionnaire (CDDQ) and the Career Decision Self-Efficacy Scale—Short Form (CDSES-SF). The results showed a significantly larger decrease in career decision difficulties and an increase in self-efficacy for those in the experimental group.

### Individual-Based MCS

One article by Hartung and Santilli (2018) presented a case study to demonstrate the MCS workbook in practice and a study to evaluate the validity of MCS as a tool to create life portraits. Participants for the study were Italian students in a career education master's degree. Students utilized the MCS to create their life portraits. Experts of the life design paradigm and its interventions also created life portraits from students' completed MCSs. Life portraits from students and experts were compared using latent semantic analysis (LSA) to determine if they produced similar macro-narratives developed from students' completed MCSs. It was found that life portraits produced by students and experts were significantly similar, thus supporting MCS as a valid instrument for creating life portraits. As validity is an important precondition of efficacy, this study lends evidence toward the MCS as an effective intervention.

# **Group-Based MCS**

The effectiveness of group-based applications of the MCS was evaluated in two quasi-experimental studies (Cardoso et al., 2018; Santilli et al., 2019). Cardoso et al. (2018) examined career certainty, career decision making, self-efficacy, and career adaptability as outcomes of this intervention. A factorial repeatedmeasures analysis of variance was performed on the pre- and post-intervention scores of Portuguese students in Grade 9 and in Grade 12. Students were divided into an experimental group (n = 120) and a control group (n = 116). Members of the experimental group participated in a course utilizing MCS, whereas members of the control group participated in a typical career course. Students were given the Vocational Certainty Scale (VCS), the Career Maturity Inventory-Form C (CMI-FC), and the Career Decision Self-Efficacy Scale—Short Form (CDSES-SF) to evaluate outcomes. The study found that the intervention had a significantly positive effect on career certainty and career self-efficacy but no effect on career adaptability. Career self-efficacy was significantly more effective with students in Grade 12. The study also ran focus groups of students from the experimental group on what they found useful and difficult about the MCS. Most students considered the MCS useful and stated that it gave them direction in career interests and self-discovery.

Santilli et al. (2019) examined the effectiveness of the MCS as a group intervention in promoting career adaptability, hope, optimism, resilience, and future orientation. A moderation analysis of pre- and post-intervention assessments was performed on Italian middle school students. Students were divided into an experimental group (n = 54) that used the MCS and a control group (n = 68) that participated in a traditional vocational guidance program. Students were assessed using the Career Adapt-Abilities Scale (CAAS), the Visions About Future (VAF) scale, and the Design My Future (DMF) scale. The experimental group was found to have significantly higher post-test scores on career adaptability and future orientation. The researchers also surveyed students to evaluate their perceptions of the utility of and their satisfaction with the intervention. A Pearson correlation found a positive relationship between satisfaction and career adaptability, hope, optimism, resilience, and orientation toward the future, suggesting that satisfaction depends on the efficacy of the intervention.

## **General Group Intervention**

Two research articles reported on a general group-based life design intervention (Ginevra et al., 2017; Maree et al., 2018). Ginevra et al. (2017) examined the efficacy of a life design intervention aimed at enhancing adolescents' and young adults' professional life stories by identifying existing strengths and fostering effective coping strategies in managing future career transitions and planning for future projects. This intervention contained three phases that utilized group instructions on effective coping strategies, assessments for existing strengths, and a workbook that facilitated the application of such strengths and strategies to participants' professional life stories. The outcomes measured were flexibility, self-directedness, positive attitudes toward the future, and career adaptability.

Italian adolescents and young adults who were disadvantaged in the labour market participated in the study. Participants were divided into an experimental group that consisted of young adults (n = 30) and a control group that included adolescents (n = 30). Outcomes were evaluated using the CAAS. A significant increase in concern and confidence was found for the participants in the experimental group, while those in the control group demonstrated a significant but mild decrease. A significant increase in control and curiosity was also found for the members of the experimental group, while no significant effect was found for members of the control group. Members of the experimental group also expressed overall satisfaction and perceived utility of the intervention in openended questions about their perceptions of the intervention. The authors also evaluated the clinical significance of the intervention by comparing participants' scores to scores of a normative sample on the CAAS. The equivalence of the experimental group and the normative sample was examined through equivalence testing. The pre-intervention assessment indicated the clinical status of the participant population. After the intervention, CAAS scores for members

of the experimental group approached equivalency with the normative sample, indicating that this group intervention has clinically significant effectiveness.

In a smaller study, Maree et al. (2018) evaluated the outcomes of career adaptability, sense of mastery, sense of relatedness, and emotional reactivity after the implementation of a group-based life design intervention. Participants were South African female adolescents who had participated in a peer supporters program. Pre- and post-intervention scores on the CAAS and on the Resiliency Scale for Children and Adolescents (RSCA) were compared using the Wilcoxon signedrank test. The analysis found a significant positive change in the sense of control as part of career adaptability, optimism and self-efficacy as parts of mastery, and comfort as part of relatedness. No significant improvements were found for emotional reactivity outcomes. Overall, this study demonstrated the potential benefits of a group-based life design intervention on adolescent career development.

## **Career Construction Genogram**

A research article by Di Fabio (2012) presented and evaluated the CCG as a life design intervention. The CCG is designed to enhance life and occupational goals by helping clients become more specific and clear in their career narratives. Italian female entrepreneurs experiencing indecision about continuing their entrepreneurial work participated in the study. Participants were divided into an experimental group (n = 33) whose members experienced the CCG and a control group (n = 36) whose members received alternative career counselling sessions. Outcomes of the CCG were evaluated using the Future Career Autobiography (FCA) tool, which assesses change in a client's occupational narrative. The FCA was administered at the beginning and at the end of participants' career counselling. A  $\chi 2$  test revealed that the members of the experimental group had experienced significantly more change in their career narratives compared to members of the control group. The narratives of the experimental group developed to be clearer and more specific, which indicated the effectiveness of the CCG.

#### **Online Intervention**

Nota et al. (2016) explored the effectiveness of an online-based intervention for life design for improving participants' career adaptability. They evaluated their online life design career counselling intervention, which involved three 2-hour sessions of video instruction and a subsequent activity aimed at enhancing concern, control, and curiosity as resources for career adaptability. Italian middle school students were the participants of the study. They were split into an experimental group (n = 100) whose members used the online intervention and a control group (n = 100) whose members participated in a traditional vocational program. Students were evaluated before and after vocational programs using a survey that pieced together test items from three scales. These scales were the Career and Education Decision Status Scale, the Ideas and Attitudes on School-Career

Future—Middle School Version, and the CAAS. Data were analyzed using a repeated measures MANOVA. The analysis determined a significant positive main effect for the experimental group on career adaptability, demonstrating the effectiveness of the intervention.

## **Elementary Classroom Intervention**

Ginevra and Nota (2018) presented a life design intervention for elementary school—age students, consisting of a 10-unit training curriculum for enhancing the two career adaptability resources of concern and curiosity. Units consisted of didactic lessons and a children's workbook. In their study, Ginevra and Nota examined both the general effectiveness of life design interventions for children and the effectiveness of their specific intervention. The study took place in Italy and included 154 students with a mean age of 10.65. An experimental design was used that compared experimental (n = 77) and control (n = 77) groups over time. Students in the experimental group were provided with the intervention, while students in the control group received the typical school-based education on career.

Pretests and post-tests consisted of several scales that measured hope, optimism, and career exploration as well as how often students had engaged in these behaviours. Students were also assessed using the Childhood Career Development Scale (CCDS) to evaluate students on the following subtests: information, curiosity, time perspective, and planning. Finally, the Occupational Knowledge Interview was used to evaluate and compare students' perceptions of their knowledge of career compared to their actual occupational knowledge. Ginevra and Nota's (2018) results generally supported the conclusion that their intervention can influence career concern and curiosity positively. A mixed-effects ANOVA on the first several scales found that only members of the intervention group increased significantly in hope, optimism, and career exploration over time. A mixed-effects MANOVA for the CCDS found that information, curiosity, time perspective, and planning increased significantly over time but only for members of the intervention group. Finally, a mixed-effect MANOVA of the Occupational Knowledge Interview found a significant positive change in actual occupational knowledge over time but only for members of the experimental group.

### Discussion

In this scoping study on life design interventions, the CCI (Savickas, 2015), the MCS (Savickas & Hartung, 2012), and the life design groups (Barclay & Stoltz, 2016) all had studies supporting their effectiveness. Interestingly, these interventions were implemented in a wide range of formats, including individual counselling, group counselling, a classroom-based intervention, and an online

counselling intervention. Evidence for the effectiveness of life design interventions held across these formats. This evidence was also generated using different research methods, populations, and outcomes.

The methods used to evaluate the effectiveness of life design interventions certainly varied. Most studies used experimental or quasi-experimental designs, with the majority of these using repeated measures and comparisons to a control group. These designs were predominantly quantitative, but several studies used qualitative measures to evaluate qualitative changes after an intervention. Other methods used were a single validity study and three case studies, which generally complement Savickas et al.'s (2009) call for a bottom-up approach to research of life design counselling.

All studies were performed outside of North America: in Italy (n = 8), in South Africa (n = 3), and in Portugal (n = 1). This seems to support Savickas et al.'s (2009) call to validate life design approaches internationally. Of these populations, participants tended to consist of students, with six studies consisting of elementary, middle, or high school students and one study consisting of university students. Other populations tended to consist of clients or of people seeking career counselling. Through these studies, it was shown that life design interventions were effective for children, adolescents, young adults, disadvantaged or marginalized populations, and people facing mid-career dilemmas.

As mentioned above, fostering career adaptability, narratability, activity, and intentionality is the main goal of life design interventions (Savickas et al., 2009). Despite this, career adaptability was the most commonly evaluated outcome across the 12 studies. The one exception to this was the CCI, where the reviewed studies assessed only the career adaptability resource of *confidence*. Evaluated CCI outcomes were a sense of direction, confidence or self-efficacy, and career identity. It is not clear why this was the case. Still, it appears that in practice, life design interventions pursue career adaptability and identity as the explicit goal of counselling, but this is done by utilizing narratability, intentionality, and activity in the process of implementing an intervention.

### Limitations

This was a scoping study and, as such, it provides an overview of the literature that was limited by the articles that were readily available at the time. This includes the period in which this scoping review was performed and the limits in the scope provided by search terms. Given that scoping studies are not designed to provide an evaluation of the quality of research (Arksey & O'Malley, 2005), in-depth conclusions about the quality of these studies could not be offered. This scoping study also did not perform a comparative evaluation of the effectiveness of these interventions. Therefore, conclusions about the general effectiveness of life design or the relative effectiveness of each intervention compared to another could not be made.

Surprisingly, no published study contained North American participants or aimed to validate the effectiveness of life design in North American contexts. Given the design of the scoping review and the number of iterations of Savickas's career counselling theories that have evolved into the life design paradigm, such empirical evidence for the effectiveness of life design for North Americans was likely filtered out. As life design is the latest iteration of Savickas's theory of career counselling, it is possible that the validation of the effectiveness of this approach in North America could be labelled under titles of earlier iterations. Such iterations included career adaptability (Savickas, 1997), career-style interview (Savickas, 2009), or simply the title of career counselling for which Savickas (2011a, 2011b, 2011c) believed career construction theory would be the general theoretical basis.

Similarly, research with North American populations may be embedded within Savickas's theoretical articles and would have been filtered out by the inclusion and exclusion criteria of this scoping review. The articles that were found by the scoping review likely reported explicitly and solely on studies that provide empirical support for the effectiveness of life design because of the call to validate life design in international contexts (Savickas et al., 2009). This call for validation suggests implicitly that validation is needed for contexts outside of life design's national home of origin that is North America (Savickas et al., 2009).

## Suggestions for Research

We suggest that additional evaluation research be conducted to establish more thoroughly the effectiveness of novel life design interventions such as the CCG. We also suggest that further research is needed on the effectiveness of life design approaches in countries outside of Europe. In particular, research with Canadian populations is needed to validate its value for Canadian career counsellors. Finally, future research should supplement the findings of experimental-based studies with more case studies. Savickas et al. (2009) argued for the value of case studies as a bottom-up analysis of practice approach to researching life design interventions. Case studies can capture contextual factors and dynamic processes that are not as evident by comparing consistency across groups of people (Savickas et al., 2009). Such a balance would allow not only for the verification of interventions but also for innovations in such interventions.

# **Suggestions for Practice**

We were struck by how life design appears to have developed relatively independently from other prominent social constructionist or narrative approaches in the broader fields of counselling and psychology. There seem to be many similarities between the life design approach to career counselling and other social constructionist forms of therapy such as narrative therapy (White, 2007; White & Epston, 1990), solution-focused therapy (SFT; de Shazer, 1994; De Jong & Berg, 2012; Walter & Peller, 1992), and postmodern approaches to family therapy

(Bateson, 1971, 1972/1987; Bowen, 1978; Tomm, 1987a, 1987b, 1988, 2014). Though the *narrative turn* in other fields of psychology and counselling has not gone unnoticed by developers of life design and other narrative-focused career counsellors (e.g., Hartung, 2013; McMahon, 2018; Shefer, 2018), it appears that life design has developed relatively independently from these other fields. This is evident in the limited reference to foundational social constructionist or postmodern articles in the fields of psychology and non-career counselling modalities in the primary articles on life design (i.e., Savickas, 1997, 2009, 2011a). It is also reflective of the proliferation of disconnected theoretical approaches and practices across different mental health professions (House & Feltham, 2015; Stam, 2004; Young & Domene, 2012). This diversity has led to restrictions of approaches and practices that result in the isolation of relatable developments and resources between said approaches and practices (Domene & Isenor, 2018; House & Feltham, 2015; Linden, 2015; Stam, 2004).

In addition to life design's goal to validate its approach in international contexts (Savickas et al., 2009), Hartung (2013) suggested that the next step for life design and other narrative approaches in career counselling is to incorporate more therapeutic practices aligned with counselling beyond career counselling. We would like to echo this suggestion and to add that researchers and practitioners of life design would benefit from incorporating other existing narrative forms of therapy found in the broader field of counselling. Engaging with relevant counselling approaches from outside of career development could produce a synergetic effect between life design and other social constructionist and narrative therapies and bridge these isolated fields (Linden, 2015).

Evidence of such bridges has occurred in social constructionist or narrative forms of career counselling, though in a piecemeal fashion. Outside of the life design approach, Shefer (2018) demonstrated an effective utilization of the therapeutic techniques of White and Epston's narrative therapy (White, 2007; White & Epston, 1990) in a narrative approach to career counselling. Such narrative approaches are also found in Cochran's (1997) narrative approach to career counselling, in McMahon and Watson's (2013) storytelling approach, and in the contextual action theory approach to career counselling (Domene & Young, 2019; Domene, Young, & Wilson, 2019; Young & Domene, 2019). Another example is the integration of Bowen's (1978) genogram from his family systems theory in career counselling (Thorngren & Feit, 2001). As seen in the scoping review, the CCG integrates genograms specifically into the life design paradigm with evidence for its effectiveness (Di Fabio, 2012). The following are several additional suggestions for possible sites of synergy between life design and other social constructionist therapies. These suggestions are not meant to be exhaustive integrations of modalities but rather are informed suggestions for further investigations and development.

# Sites of Synergy

SFT (De Jong, & Berg, 2012; de Shazer, 1994; Walter & Peller, 1992) offers many resources for creating an effective intervention that targets the four Cs of resources for career adaptability (Santilli et al., 2019) and developing actionable next steps (Savickas, 2011a, 2012). SFT gives primacy to goals as opposed to problems and anchors defined goals in a client's past and present strengths and successes (de Shazer, 1994; Walter & Peller, 1992). This approach to goal setting would support a client's agency and motivation in the third phase of life design by co-constructing intentions and actions built on clients' past experiences of success (Savickas, 2011a, 2012).

In addition to goal setting, SFT could offer techniques in supporting other aspects of life design. One example of this is fostering markers that identify being on track toward career goals based on clients' strengths and motivations (Walter & Peller, 1992). Much like the CCG (Di Fabio, 2012), SFT could also help make clients more specific and clear in their career narratives. Finally, the *miracle question* (de Shazer, 1994) could be an effective SFT technique to explore career identity through cultivating personal and professional values that define a client's career narrative.

Savickas (2016) explained that life design enhances clients' agency through a process of reflection and reflexivity that empowers clients to bring change into themselves. Postmodern approaches to family therapy offer many resources to support a client's reflexive orientation (Bateson, 1971, 1972/1987; Bowen, 1978; Tomm, 1987a, 1987b, 1988, 2014). In the context of family therapy, Tomm (1987b) described goals of reflexive questions that were similar to those Savickas (2016) described for life design. Tomm (1987b) described reflexive questions as those that "facilitate self-healing in an individual or family by activating the reflexivity among meanings within pre-existing belief systems that enable family members to generate or generalize constructive patterns of cognition and behavior on their own" (p. 4). These postmodern approaches also have a circular orientation as opposed to a linear orientation toward causality (Bateson, 1971, 1972/1987; Tomm, 1987a, 1987b, 1988, 2014), which emphasizes recursive and patterned understandings of client concerns. Such an orientation could foster interventions that promote self-observation (Savickas, 2016) of patterns that impact clients' career narratives. We suggest developing additional life design interventions informed by circular orientations and reflective questioning as developed by postmodern family therapy approaches to enhance agency in the clients in their change.

Finally, we would like to direct readers to Shefer (2018) for many suggestions in which narrative therapy techniques can be effective for addressing career counselling concerns in ways consistent with existing life design interventions. For example, several specific narrative therapy techniques could enhance the effectiveness of MCS (Savickas & Hartung, 2012): the narrative therapy practices of externalization and re-authoring (White, 2007; White & Epston, 1990) would be

helpful for the respective Part 1 and Part 2 of MCS. Part 1 consists of the first step toward building a career narrative through identifying small stories about career at different points in clients' lives and Part 2 consists of helping clients arrange these small stories into a larger career narrative (Savickas & Hartung, 2012).

Externalization is defined as "a practice supported by the belief that a problem is something operating or impacting on or pervading a person's life, something separate and different from the person" (Freedman & Combs, 1996, p. 47). Following this definition, externalization (White, 2007; White & Epston, 1990) would help a client separate their career identity from their current career crisis and facilitate the recognition of small stories that reflect their preferred career identity. Therefore, externalization would foster clients' agency by building a career identity not predicated on career crisis but on past stories that reflect clients' experience with their preferred career identity. Re-authoring, then, is the process in which these small stories of the preferred identity are arranged into a new dominant narrative based on a client's preferred identity (White, 2007; White & Epston, 1990). Therefore, re-authoring fits similar goals as Part 2 of MCS (Savickas & Hartung, 2012). Re-authoring may enhance Part 2 by plotting the new career narrative in small stories that already reflect identification with the preferred career identity and arguably should bolster clients' career adaptability during this process (Santilli et al., 2019).

To summarize, we believe that social constructionist approaches found in the broader field of counselling have the potential to synergize well with the life design approach to career counselling. SFT's emphasis on goals defined by a client's past and present strengths could enhance effectiveness in promoting clients' agency and motivation in the final phases of the life design approach. Similarly, postmodern approaches to family therapy offer many techniques to help enhance clients' reflexive orientation and to promote self-observation. Finally, narrative therapies offer such techniques like externalization and re-authoring that map well already onto the life design approach and present methods that would strengthen the process of identifying preferred career identities while promoting career adaptability. We also suggest that further research is needed to identify additional sites of synergy and to incorporate such approaches effectively to benefit the life design approach.

#### References

Arksey, H., & O'Malley, L. (2005). Scoping studies: Towards a methodological framework. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 8(1), 19–32. https://doi.org/10.1080/1364557032000119616

Barclay, S. R., & Stoltz, K. B. (2016). *The life design group guide*. http://www.vocopher.com/ Susan%20Barclay/THE%20LIFE%20DESIGN%20GROUP%20GUIDE\_Barclay-Stoltz\_2016.pdf

Bateson, G. (1971). The cybernetics of "self": A theory of alcoholism. *Psychiatry*, *34*(1), 1–18. https://doi.org/10.1080/00332747.1971.11023653

- Bateson, G. (1987). Steps to an ecology of mind: Collected essays in anthropology, psychiatry, evolution, and epistemology. Jason Aronson. (Original work published 1972)
- Bowen, M. (1978). Family therapy in clinical practice. Jason Aronson.
- Cardoso, P., Janeiro, I. N., & Duarte, M. E. (2018). Life design counseling group intervention with Portuguese adolescents: A process and outcome study. *Journal of Career Development*, 45(2), 183–196. https://doi.org/10.1177/0894845316687668
- Cochran, L. (1997). Career counseling: A narrative approach. SAGE Publications.
- De Jong, P., & Berg, I. K. (2012). *Interviewing for solutions* (4th ed.). Brooks/Cole, Cengage Learning.
- de Shazer, S. (1994). Words were originally magic. W. W. Norton and Company.
- Di Fabio, A. (2012). Evaluation of the effectiveness of the Career Construction Genogram. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences*, 7(4), 287–297.
- Di Fabio, A. (2016). Life design and career counseling innovative outcomes. *Career Development Quarterly*, 64(1), 35–48. https://doi.org/10.1002/cdq.12039
- Di Fabio, A., & Maree, J. G. (2012). Group-based life design counseling in an Italian context. Journal of Vocational Behavior, 80(1), 100–107. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2011.06.001
- Domene, J. F., & Isenor, J. (2018). Career service provision in Canada: Deep roots and diverse practices. In H. J. Yoon, B. Hutchison, M. Maze, C. Pritchard, & A. Reiss (Eds.), *International practices of career services, credentials, and training* (pp. 32–48). National Career Development Association. https://ncda.org/aws/NCDA/asset\_manager/get\_file/259695?ver=2868
- Domene, J. F., & Young, R. A. (2019). Career counselling using contextual action theory: Key concepts for practice. In N. Arthur, R. Neault, & M. McMahon (Eds.), *Career theories and models at work: Ideas for practice* (pp. 115–124). CERIC.
- Domene, J. F., Young, R. A., & Wilson, C. (2019). Career counselling for emerging adults based on goal-directed action: An innovative approach to theory, research, and practice. In J. G. Maree (Ed.), *Handbook of innovative career counselling* (pp. 557–575). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-22799-9\_31
- Freedman, J., & Combs, G. (1996). Narrative therapy: The social construction of preferred realities. W. W. Norton and Company.
- Ginevra, M. C., Di Maggio, I., Nota, L., & Soresi, S. (2017). Stimulating resources to cope with challenging times and new realities: Effectiveness of a career intervention. *International Journal for Educational and Vocational Guidance*, 17(1), 77–96. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10775-016-9331-0
- Ginevra, M. C., & Nota, L. (2018). "Journey in the world of professions and work": A career intervention for children. *Journal of Positive Psychology*, 13(5), 460–470. https://doi.org/ 10.1080/17439760.2017.1303532
- Hartung, P. J. (2013). *Career as story: Making the narrative turn.* In W. B. Walsh, M. L. Savickas, & P. J. Hartung (Eds.), *Handbook of vocational psychology: Theory, research, and practice* (4th ed., pp. 33–52). Routledge.
- Hartung, P. J., & Santilli, S. (2018). My career story: Description and initial validity evidence. *Journal of Career Assessment*, 26(2), 308–321. https://doi.org/10.1177/1069072717692980
- Hartung, P. J., & Vess, L. (2019). Career construction for life design: Practice and theory. In N. Arthur & M. McMahon (Eds.), *Contemporary theories of career development: International perspectives* (pp. 91–104). Routledge.
- House, R., & Feltham, C. (2015). Counselling psychology: Critical achievements, possibilities, and limitations. In I. Parker (Ed.), *Handbook of critical psychology* (pp. 164–172). Routledge.

- Linden, W. (2015). From silos to bridges: Psychology on the move. *Canadian Psychology*, 56(1), 1–5. https://doi.org/10.1037/cap0000016
- Maree, J. G. (2014). Career construction with a gay client: A case study. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, 42(4), 436–449. https://doi.org/10.1080/03069885.2014.886670
- Maree, J. G. (2017). Mid-career construction counselling to instill spiritual awareness and allay fear. *South African Journal of Education*, *37*(4), Article 1443. https://doi.org/10.15700/saje.v37n4a1443
- Maree, J. G., Pienaar, M., & Fletcher, L. (2018). Enhancing the sense of self of peer supporters using life design-related counselling. *South African Journal of Psychology*, 48(4), 420–433. https://doi.org/10.1177/0081246317742246
- McMahon, M. (2018). Narrative career counselling: A tension between potential, appeal, and proof. *Australian Journal of Career Development*, 27(2), 57–64. https://doi.org/10.1177/1038416218785537
- McMahon, M., & Watson, M. (2013). Story telling: Crafting identities. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, 41(3), 277–286. https://doi.org/10.1080/03069885.2013.78 9824
- Nota, L., Santilli, S., & Soresi, S. (2016). A life-design-based online career intervention for early adolescents: Description and initial analysis. *Career Development Quarterly*, 64(1), 4–19. https://doi.org/10.1002/cdq.12037
- Santilli, S., Nota, L., & Hartung, P. J. (2019). Efficacy of a group career construction intervention with early adolescent youth. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 111, 49–58. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2018.06.007
- Savickas, M. L. (1997). Career adaptability: An integrative construct for life-span, life-space theory. Career Development Quarterly, 45(3), 247–259. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2161-0045.1997. tb00469.x
- Savickas, M. L. (2005). The theory and practice of career construction. In S. D. Brown & R. W. Lent (Eds.), *Career development and counseling: Putting theory and research to work* (pp. 42–70). John Wiley and Sons.
- Savickas, M. L. (2009). Career-style counseling. In T. J. Sweeney (Ed.), *Adlerian counseling* and psychotherapy: A practitioner's approach (5th ed., pp. 183–207). Routledge.
- Savickas, M. L. (2011a). Career counseling. American Psychological Association.
- Savickas, M. L. (2011b). New questions for vocational psychology: Premises, paradigms, and practices. *Journal of Career Assessment*, 19(3), 251–258. https://doi.org/10.1177/1069072710395532
- Savickas, M. L. (2011c). Constructing careers: Actor, agent, and author. *Journal of Employment Counseling*, 48(4), 179–181. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2161-1920.2011.tb01109.x
- Savickas, M. L. (2012). Life design: A paradigm for career intervention in the 21st century. Journal of Counseling and Development, 90(1), 13–19. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1556-6676.2012.00002.x
- Savickas, M. L. (2015). *Life-design counseling manual*. http://www.vocopher.com/LifeDesign/LifeDesign.pdf
- Savickas, M. L. (2016). Reflection and reflexivity during life-design interventions: Comments on career construction counseling. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, *97*, 84–89. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2016.09.001
- Savickas, M. L., & Hartung, P. J. (2012). My career story: An autobiographical workbook for life-career success. http://www.vocopher.com/CSI/CCI\_workbook.pdf
- Savickas, M. L., Nota, L., Rossier, J., Dauwalder, J.-P., Duarte, M. E., Guichard, J., Soresi, S., Van Esbroeck, R., & van Vianen, A. E. M. (2009). Life designing: A paradigm for

- career construction in the 21st century. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 75(3), 239–250. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2009.04.004
- Shefer, T. (2018). Narrative career therapy: From the problem-saturated story to a preferred story and career path. *Australian Journal of Career Development*, 27(2), 99–107. https://doi.org/10.1177/1038416218785175
- Stam, H. J. (2004). Unifying psychology: Epistemological act or disciplinary maneuver? *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 60(12), 1259–1262. https://doi.org/10.1002/jclp.20069
- Stoltz, K. B., & Barclay, S. R. (2015). *The life design theme mapping guide*. http://www.vocopher.com/Susan%20Barclay/THE%20LIFE%20DESIGN%20THEME-MAPPING%20GUIDE\_v.3.pdf
- Super, D. E. (1957). The psychology of careers: An introduction to vocational development. Harper and Row.
- Super, D. E. (1990). A life-span, life-space approach to career development. In D. Brown, L. Brooks, & Associates (Eds.), *Career choice and development: Applying contemporary theories to practice* (2nd ed., pp. 197–261). Jossey-Bass.
- Super, D. E., Savickas, M. L., & Super, C. M. (1996). The life-span, life-space approach to careers. In D. Brown, L. Brooks, & Associates (Eds.), *Career choice and development* (3rd ed., pp. 121–178). Jossey-Bass.
- Thorngren, J. M., & Feit, S. S. (2001). The Career-O-Gram: A postmodern career intervention. Career Development Quarterly, 49(4), 291–303. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2161-0045.2001. tb00957.x
- Tomm, K. (1987a). Interventive interviewing: Part I. Strategizing as a fourth guideline for the therapist. *Family Process*, 26(1), 3–13. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1545-5300.1987.00003.x
- Tomm, K. (1987b). Interventive interviewing: Part II. Reflexive questioning as a means to enable self-healing. *Family Process*, 26(2), 167–183. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1545-5300.1987.00167.x
- Tomm, K. (1988). Interventive interviewing: Part III. Intending to ask lineal, circular, strategic, or reflexive questions? *Family Process*, 27(1), 1–15. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1545-5300.1988.00001.x
- Tomm, K. (2014). Introducing the IPscope: A systemic assessment tool for distinguishing interpersonal patterns. In K. Tomm, S. St. George, D. Wulff, & T. Strong (Eds.), *Patterns in interpersonal interactions: Inviting relational understandings for therapeutic change* (pp. 13–35). Routledge.
- Walter, J. L., & Peller, J. E. (1992). Becoming solution-focused in brief therapy. Routledge.
- White, M. (2007). *Maps of narrative practice*. W. W. Norton and Company.
- White, M., & Epston, D. (1990). Narrative means to therapeutic ends. W. W. Norton and Company.
- Young, R. A., & Domene, J. F. (2012). Creating a research agenda in career counselling: The place of action theory. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, 40(1), 15–30. https://doi.org/10.1080/03069885.2011.620603
- Young, R. A., & Domene, J. F. (2019). Contextual action theory: Concepts, processes, and examples. In N. Arthur & M. McMahon (Eds.), *Contemporary theories of career development: International perspectives* (pp. 78–90). Routledge.

## **About the Authors**

Bradley Lewis is an MSc student in the educational psychology program in the Werklund School of Education at the University of Calgary. He specializes in counselling psychology and has research interests in social emotional learning approaches in education and in social constructionist approaches to counselling psychology. He is also a registered provisional psychologist in the province of Alberta.

José F. Domene is a professor of counselling psychology in the Werklund School of Education at the University of Calgary. His research interests include relational contexts of career development and professional issues in counselling and counselling psychology in Canada. He is also a registered psychologist in the province of Alberta. https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8889-7005

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Bradley Lewis, University of Calgary, 2500 University Drive NW, Calgary, Alberta, Canada, T2N 1N4. Email: lewisbk@ucalgary.ca