Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy /
Revue canadienne de counseling et de psychothérapie
ISSN 0826-3893 Vol. 50 No. 4 © 2016 Pages 365–383

A Content Analysis of Gendered Research in the *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy*
Une analyse de contenu de la recherche sexospécifique dans la *Revue canadienne de counseling et de psychothérapie*

Robinder P. Bedi
Courtney N. Young
Jaleh A. Davari
Karen L. Springer
Daniel P. Kane
Western Washington University

ABSTRACT

There is increased awareness of but limited quantification of the lack of published scholarship about boys and men in counselling. We conducted a content analysis on articles published in the *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy* from 2000 to 2013 to examine gender differences in research participants and to explore the topics published. After reviewing 293 articles, we found that female-topic-specific articles outnumbered male-topic-specific articles by 3:1 and research studies based on exclusively female client/student samples outnumbered those based on exclusively male samples by about 4:1. When examining only gender-specific articles that were intentionally seeking to look at a particular gender—not including the four articles in Vol. 46, No. 4 (2012), the special issue on boys/men—the ratio of female-specific articles to male-specific articles is about 5:1; for research studies that ratio is about 15:1. This leaves clinicians with a small Canadian research base from which to provide gender-sensitive and evidence-based interventions with boys/men.

RÉSUMÉ

On assiste à une prise de conscience croissante, mais peu quantifiée, de la pénurie de publications de recherche au sujet des garçons et des hommes dans le domaine du counseling. Nous avons mené une analyse de contenu des articles publiés dans la *Revue canadienne de counseling et de psychothérapie* de 2000 à 2013 afin d'examiner les différences relatives au genre des participants aux recherches et d'explorer les sujets publiés. Après avoir examiné 293 articles, nous avons constaté que les articles portant spécifiquement sur des sujets féminins étaient 3 fois plus nombreux que ceux portant sur des sujets spécifiquement masculins, tandis que les études basées exclusivement sur des échantillons de clientes ou d'étudiantes étaient environ 4 fois plus nombreuses que les études basées sur des échantillons exclusivement masculins. En examinant uniquement les articles sexospécifiques visant à étudier précisément un genre en particulier—exception faite des quatre articles du Vol. 46, No. 4 (2012), soit le numéro spécial sur les garçons et les hommes—on constate que le nombre d'articles spécifiquement féminins est 5 fois plus grand que celui des articles spécifiquement masculins, et le rapport passe à environ 15 pour 1 dans le cas des études de recherche. Il en résulte que les cliniciens ne disposent que d'une petite base de recherche

canadienne pour appuyer des interventions auprès des garçons et des hommes qui soient sensibles à la dimension de genre et fondées sur des données probantes.

Whereas well-established guidelines exist for ethical and best practices with girls and women (American Psychological Association, 2007; Canadian Psychological Association, 2007), comparable documents for adapting counselling and psychotherapy to better serve the unique needs of boys and men are not available. Existing therapeutic approaches have only infrequently been modified to account for the conventional male gender role (Brooks, 2010), and studies show that men and women often have different expectations of the counsellor (Reznicek-Parrado, 2013; Schaub & Williams, 2007). In addition, men seek counselling less often than women, likely due to the limited masculine gender competence exhibited by clinicians (Deering & Gannon, 2005; Ogrodniczuk, 2006; Owen, Wong, & Rodolfa, 2009), which, in turn, may be partially due to the meagre amount of guiding empirical research available on boys/men participating in counselling or psychotherapy.

All of the above is occurring despite the widely cited study that showed boys and men make up 34.4% of individuals participating in counselling and psychotherapy (Vessey & Howard, 1993). More recent research indicated an increase in the number of men receiving counselling or psychotherapy, such that men now make up about 40% of those receiving such services in the United States (Karlin, Duffy, & Gleaves, 2008). However, with respect specifically to a suicidal clientele—individuals perhaps most in need of psychological intervention—examination of a representative sample of adult Canadians with suicidal ideation indicated that men make up only about 26.7% of those likely to consult a psychologist when thinking of suicide (Cox, 2014).

Mainstream counselling and psychotherapy research and practices have been slow to integrate the culture of Canadian masculinity (i.e., the shared beliefs, values, customs, roles, and ways of behaving commonly manifest in the majority of men in Canada; for further explication of masculinity as a culture, see Brooks, 2010). Based on slowly emerging recognition of this deficit (Westwood & Black, 2012), the *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy* (CJCP) recently published a special issue partly focused on male issues (Vol. 46, No. 4, 2012). Excluding the introduction, which outlined the rationale for the special issue and briefly summarized its contents, this special issue contained four articles, three of which were empirical research articles. In total, these articles represented the experience of only 7 men (only 6 of whom were counselling clients).

Included in this special issue was a preliminary study, which served as the basis for the current study. Hoover, Bedi, and Beall (2012) found, through examining abstracts from 2000 to halfway through 2011, females or female issues were examined more frequently than males or male issues in CJCP, at a ratio of 12:1. Hoover et al. used a conservative definition of female or male issues, in terms of the authors of the articles explicitly identifying their article as focused on boys/men, girls/women, masculinity (male gender role), or femininity (female gender role).

As proposed by Westwood and Black (2012), there is a clear need for continued research on how best to provide mental health services to boys and men. The present study is a comprehensive empirical examination of variables related to gender in CJCP (formerly known as the *Canadian Journal of Counselling*) from 2000 to 2013. As in Hoover et al. (2012), the primary intention was to assess the gender focus—intentional (e.g., part of the objective of the study) and incidental (by chance, such as through convenience sampling)—of articles in CJCP and to quantify the frequency at which males, compared to females, are researched. The present study also updates the pilot-study research results to the start of 2014. Based on the preliminary results (Hoover et al., 2012), it was expected that articles targeting content related uniquely to females or utilizing an exclusively female sample would greatly outnumber content related uniquely to males or utilizing an exclusively male sample, and at a level that exceeds the representation of men in counselling.

The secondary purpose of the present study, where it goes well beyond the pilot study, was to identify the characteristics of the CJCP articles that focused exclusively or primarily on boys and men, to quantify discrepancies in sample size, and to summarize the research implications that can be used to help promote gender sensitivity and evidence-based practice for boys and men receiving mental health services. Because CJCP is the only Canadian journal devoted exclusively to counselling and psychotherapy in Canada and is the official publication of the Canadian Counselling and Psychotherapy Association (representing the largest national body of counsellors and psychotherapists in Canada), it exerts disproportionate influence on those seeking resources in terms of applying research to practice. In sum, the current paper is a substantial expansion of the previous pilot study and includes a larger data set, additional variables for examination (e.g., sample size), greater research rigour, and the utilization of inferential statistics and increased analyses, which provide for greater precision in the presentation and discussion of the results.

METHOD

A quantitative content analysis was conducted on articles published in CJCP. Content analysis is a research method designed to identify the presence of certain words or concepts within text (e.g., journal articles, books, transcribed interviews, advertising, newspaper headlines) and then make broader inferences (about the deeper message, the writers, the culture, etc.; Finfgeld-Connett, 2014). The primary purpose of this content analysis was to assess gender-focused scholarship and the gender distribution of research samples in CJCP. A secondary purpose was to examine the characteristics of the male-focused articles. The data collection included 293 articles from Vol. 34, No. 1 (2000) to Vol. 47, No. 4 (2013), excluding book reviews and "Introduction to the Special Issue" articles (see Table 1), which generally focused on summarizing the special issue articles and were thus not really independent pieces of scholarship that added much beyond the article summaries.

Table 1
Excluded Special Issue Introduction Articles (2000–2013)

Title (Authors)	Year	Volume:Number
Counselling First Nations People in Canada (Heilbron & Guttman)	2000	34:1
Innovations in Career and Employment Counselling (Borgen)	2000	34:3
Multicultural Counselling in the New Millennium: Introduction to the Special Theme Issue (Arthur & Stewart)	2001	35:1
Comprehensive Guidance and Counselling Introduction to the Special Theme Issue (Hiebert)	2002	36:1
Action Theory and Counselling (Young & Maranda)	2002	36:2
Introduction to the Special Issue on Youth Violence (Loeber)	2002	36:4
Introduction to the Special Theme Issue—Living with Serious Illness: Innovations in Counselling (Jevne & Larsen)	2003	37:1
Introduction to Special Theme Issue—Multicultural Counselling: Embracing Cultural Diversity (Ishiyama & Arvay)	2003	37:3
Introduction to Professional Issues in Counselling Practice (Schulz)	2004	38:1
Supervising the Counsellor Trainee in the New Millennium (Daniels & Uhlemann)	2004	38:3
Introduction to the Special Issue [Career Counselling for Women] (Marshall & Fournier)	2005	39:3
Introduction to Special Issue on Graduate Student Research in Counselling Psychology (Pyle & Truscott)	2008	42:4
Entering the Conversation: Introduction to the Special Issue (*Paré & Thériault)*	2010	44:3
Introduction to the Special Issue of the *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy* (Westwood & Black)	2012	46:4
Introduction to the Special Issue on Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity in Counselling Psychology (Roughley & Morrison)	2013	47:1
Introduction to Special Issue: A Special Thematic Issue on Evolving Practices in Career Development (Goyer & Fournier)	2013	47:2

Through examining a random sampling of about a dozen articles from CJCP, an extensive coding scale was created representing 854 possible variables of interest. The coding scale is available by e-mail to the first author. Some examples of items coded included article title, issue and volume number, number of participants, participant demographics, article type (i.e., empirical research study, theoretical article, program development), and gender focus. Articles discussing primarily males (defined as > 54.9% of the sample) and only males (100%) were coded further for more detailed characteristics. Some examples of additional coding fields included research methodologies, author demographics, research findings, and content category (e.g., career/academic, multicultural, disorders/symptoms, identity development).

Procedure

The final version of the coding scale was the outgrowth of pilot testing and revision of five earlier versions. To maximize consistency and accuracy during data collection, research assistants were trained in using the coding scale for about three months. The study made use of 12 research assistants (4 men and 8 women). Three were graduate students and 9 were undergraduate students. Each undergraduate student except one had completed one class in research design and one class in statistics at the time of data collection. Each research assistant was first randomly assigned one year to code and was matched with another research assistant as a coding partner (who was also randomly assigned to a year). As soon as a research assistant completed all of the coding for a certain year, he or she was randomly assigned another year. The exception to this was the 31 French language articles.

Articles in French from 2000 to 2011 (n = 25) were assigned to two female undergraduate research assistants who were the only ones on the research team at that time who had French fluency. Articles in 2012 and 2013 (n = 6) were assigned to two different research assistants: one male graduate research assistant who had French fluency and one partially fluent female graduate student who used a Google-translated version of the article to assist her limited French language capabilities.

The first step of data collection involved 2 research assistants individually reading an article from their assigned year and filling out the coding instrument. Next, coding partners met and compared their coded instruments to reach a consensus. Research assistants produced an average agreement of 99.6% (SD = 1.0) of data points on the coding instrument. Partners attempted to resolve any coding discrepancies through discussion and re-review of the article. Consensual coding scales were then sent to the first author for further review and critique. Any queries were addressed consensually or by democratic vote of the first author and the two coders.

Due to almost no information being obtained for some variables and some variables being determined to be largely duplicative, a total of 542 variables were selected to be entered into SPSS 20 for analyses after all articles were coded. Two research assistants independently checked the accuracy of the completed data entry from the coding instruments. Descriptive statistics were conducted that examined the gender distribution of articles in CJCP, as well as the various characteristics of the gender-exclusive and gender-focused samples and research studies. Statistical tests of differences (i.e., t-tests) were also conducted to compare sample sizes of male versus female participants. Most of the subsequent analyses were focused on the research articles involving samples of service recipients (i.e., clients or students) or the nonresearch articles speaking particularly to male service recipients (i.e., clients or students). Information about research or scholarship on service providers (i.e., mental health professionals) is generally excluded below; the focus is on those who received counselling or related services.

RESULTS

With respect to the gender distribution of the 293 articles, 136 (46.4%) had samples consisting of individuals who were counselling or related service recipients (e.g., clients, students); the remaining 157 (53.6%) were nonresearch articles or had samples composed of mental health professionals and other service providers. The gender focus of *all* the articles is summarized in Table 2, and the gender distribution of only the research articles is summarized in Table 3. Table 2 indicates that female-topic-specific articles (about clients, students, etc.) outnumbered male-topic-specific articles at a ratio of 3:1, and research studies based on exclusively female samples outnumbered those based on exclusively male samples at a ratio of about 4:1.

When only considering the research articles that specifically set out to exclusively investigate boys or men in comparison to girls or women, the ratio of intentional female-only research articles to male-only research articles was 6:1. Westwood and Black were aware of this lack of Canadian scholarship on boys/men in counselling and acted as guest editors for a special issue (see Westwood & Black, 2012). If the four articles (three research articles and one nonempirical article that were all intentionally focused on males only) in Vol. 46, No. 4 (2012) were to be excluded, these ratios would be 4:1 (female to male articles) and almost 7:1 (female to male research studies), respectively. As well, when looking only at gender-specific articles that were intentional in nature (i.e., set out to specifically investigate either females or males) and excluding the four articles in the special issue, the ratio of intentional female articles to intentional male articles is about 5:1 and of intentional female to intentional male research studies is about 15:1.

In other words, prior to the three research studies intentionally and exclusively about males in the special issue, only two studies published in CJCP from 2000 to late 2012 were specifically on male clients or students and were planned to be only about boys or men. Another way of looking at this is that research on boys and men has not been well-integrated and proportionate over the years in CJCP*;* much of it was published in one journal issue to address the topic.

In addition, less than 3.8% of all research samples of clients/students had a clear male majority (vs. 14.7% for females). After removing one outlier study with an extremely large sample size (Jorgensen et al., 2005; $N = 42{,}010$; $n = 20{,}108$ males), the total number of males and females in the client/student samples were 5,945 males ($M = 48.3$, $SD = 117.6$; $n = 123$ studies) and 9,517 females ($M = 78.0$, $SD = 205.2$; $n = 122$ studies). (Jorgensen et al., 2005, was removed because it had almost three times as many participants as the sum of all the other research studies published in CJCP during the time frame of the study. This would exert an extremely disproportionate influence on the calculation of means and standard deviations, both of which are quite sensitive to unrepresentative and extreme values. The mean sample size of males versus females being studied in CJCP research indicates a statistically significant difference, with female sample sizes generally being about 30 participants larger, on average ($t = 2.86$, $df = 121$; $p = .005$, $d =$

Table 2
Gender Focus in All CJCP Articles from 2000 to 2013 (N = 293)

	Only male clients/ students	Only male pro.	Primarily male clients/ students	Primarily male pro.	Only female clients/ students	Only female pro.	Primarily female clients/ students	Primarily female pro.	Balanced	Unknown	Only trans-gendered	Primarily trans-gendered
Intentional	10 [a, b]	1	0	0	32	6	1	0	17	—	1	0
Incidental	3	1	11	1	4	4	42	25	116	—	0	1
Total	13	2	11	1	36	10	43	25	133	17	1	1

Note. "Pro." refers to education/career or mental health professionals (i.e., nonclients, nonstudents). "Balanced" refers to a mixed gender sample where the percentage of males and females in the sample are less than 10% discrepant (e.g., the maximum discrepancy would be 54.9% vs. 45.1%). Samples possessing at least 55% of a single gender were deemed either primarily of that gender or only of that gender.
[a]Within intentionally only male clients/students: Vegter (2013) had a sample of female-to-male transgendered individuals, but the article focus was about male conceptualization and is thus included here. While Hoover et al. (2012) and Foster (2012) did not have participants, but were rather a content analysis study and a research review, respectively, these two articles were about male clients/students and thus were also included. [b]The four articles in the *CJCP* 2012 special issue on males included four intentional male-only articles.

Table 3
Gender Distribution of Client/Student, Empirical Research Studies (N = 132)

	Only male		Primarily male		Only female		Primarily female		Balanced		Unknown	
	n	%	*n*	%	*n*	%	*n*	%	*N*	%	*n*	%
Intentional	5[a]	3.7	0	0	29	21.3	1	0.7	2	1.5	—	—
Incidental	3	2.2	11	8.1	4	2.9	42	30.9	24	17.7	—	—
Total	8	5.9	11	8.1	33	24.3	43	31.6	26	19.1	11	8.1

Note. Only 132 of the 136 studies are presented because three studies on transgendered persons (studies with no cisgender males or cisgender females in them) and one study that had an unknown sample size are excluded here. Therefore, the percentages add up to 97.1% (132/136) as the four excluded studies were still "client/student, empirical research studies." "Unknown" in the table above indicates that the sample size was listed in the article, but no gender breakdown was provided (therefore, we were unable to judge whether the gender distribution was intentional or incidental).
[a]The three research articles in the *CJCP* 2012 special issue on males were all intentional.

0.37). No significant difference was observed in the mean age of client/student males and females (mean age of males = 26.2, *SD* = 10.2; mean age of females = 26.9, *SD* = 12.0). In addition, 92 (67.7%) of the 136 empirical research studies on clients or students had at least one male participant.

As noted in Table 3, out of the 132 research articles with a listed sample size that included at least one male or female participant, there were 8 male-only (6%) and 11 primarily male (8%) studies compared to 33 female-only (24%) and 43 primarily female (32%) studies. Among the male-only research studies, only 5 intentionally had a male-only focus, yet 29 of the female-only research studies were intentionally focused on females. Twenty-six articles had a balanced gender focus (19%), and 11 articles did not provide the gender distribution of their study's sample (8%) despite providing an overall sample size.

Among the 136 empirical research articles with client/student samples, the 32 female-only studies had larger sample sizes on average (*M* = 23.69, *SD* = 50.5) than did the 8 male-only studies (*M* = 7.38, *SD* = 8.4, *d* = 0.45). Information from 1 of the 33 female-only empirical research studies with client/student samples was excluded from the calculation because its sample size was unknown.

Further analysis of the 8 male-only, client/student, empirical research studies (2.7% of all articles; 5.9% of all client/student studies) showed that 5 were intentionally focused on only males (1.7%; 3.7%) and 3 were incidentally focused (1.0%; 2.2%). At the time of initial submission of this article, only one of these male-only research studies was cited notably (four times in PsycINFO; Darou, Kurtness, & Hum, 2000), and the remaining were cited 0–2 times (see Table 4). In Google Scholar, a more liberal source of citations, only one was cited more than 10 times (Darou et al., 2000). All of the 11 primarily male, client/student, empirical research studies (3.8% of all articles; 8.1% of all research studies) were incidentally focused, and only 4 were cited in PsycINFO. However, two were cited 4–6 times in Google Scholar (Palmer & Daniluk, 2007; Sinacore, Park-Saltzman, Mikhail, & Wada, 2011) and two were cited 9–12 times (Ponsford & Lapadat, 2001; Sturgeon & Morrissette, 2010); the remaining were cited 0–3 times. It can be concluded that the male-only articles published in CJCP were having little impact on published scholarship, as indicated by their lack of citations.

Furthermore, it was observed that most of the male-only research articles were qualitative studies (see Table 5). In addition, the generalizability (for quantitative studies) or transferability (for qualitative studies) of each male-only research study was loosely judged by the third and fourth authors based on criteria approved by the first author (see Table 6; e-mail for a copy of the guidelines). Generalizability (i.e., external validity) and transferability refer to the capacity to apply research findings across populations and/or contexts and would be a reasonable basis for a clinician to justifiably apply the results of research to practice. Overall, we judged that research findings from CJCP studies pertaining to male-only client/student samples produced low generalizability/transferability on research grounds, a problem for clinicians seeking to apply this information to their work with clients.

Table 4
Description of Only Male-Focused Articles with Client/Student Samples

Author(s) (Year)	Type of article	Sample size	Develop-mental level	Sample info	Diagnosis/concerns	PsycINFO times cited	Google Scholar times cited
Darou, Kurtness, & Hum (2000)	Empirical Research Study	13	Adult	Students	None	4	20
De Stefano, Bernardelli, Stalikas, & Iwakabe (2001)	Empirical Research Study	1	Adult	Counselling Clients, Outpatient Diagnosed	Marital Separation, Adjustment Disorder	1	3
Spain, Bédard, & Paiement (2004)	Empirical Research Study	12	Adult	Mixed College/ University Student and Non-Student Adults	Career Development	1	3
Buitenbos (2012)	[Auto] Ethnography/ Case Study	1	Adult	Outpatient, Counselling/Non-Diagnosis, Patients/Clients	"…do significant repair work around old wounds that had played a key role in my decisions, behaviour, and psychological health for over two decades" (p. 336).	0	1
Grove (2012)	Empirical Research Study	6	Adult	Outpatient, Clinical/ Diagnosed, Patients/Clients	Depression	0	0
Kerner, Fitzpatrick, Rozworska, & Hutman (2012)	[Auto] Ethnography/ Case Study	1	Adolescent	Students	Career Exploration	0	0
Dmytro, Luft, Jenkins, Hoard, & Cameron (2013)	Empirical Research Study	24	Adolescent	High School Students	Concerns Regarding Roles in Relationships	N/A	0
Estefan & Roughley (2013)	[Auto] Ethnography/ Case Study	1	Adult	2nd-Year University Student	Uncomfortable Issues About Sexual Orientation	0	2

Table 5
Research Information About Only Male Studies with Clients/Students

Author(s) (Year)	Research method	Research design	PsycINFO subject	PsycINFO keywords	PsycINFO topic
Darou, Kurtness, & Hum (2000)	Questionnaire assessing reactions to being in a psychological quasi-experiment	Mixed methods	American Indians, Cultural Sensitivity, Experimental Methods, Racial and Ethnic Attitudes, Sociocultural Factors, Experimental Subjects, Experimenters	Conflict With Native Values, Attitudes Toward Psychological Research, Behavior of Researchers Toward Subjects, Perceived Social Value of Research, Male 18-25 Yr. Old Cree	Culture & Ethnology
De Stefano, Bernardelli, Stalikas, & Iwakabe (2001)	Single case study	Quantitative	Brief Psychotherapy, Client Attitudes, Optimism, Psychotherapeutic Counselling, Psychotherapeutic Processes, Clients, Psychotherapists, Response Parameters	Therapist-Client Relationship, Therapist Verbal Response Mode, Client Good Moments, Short-Term Dynamic Psychotherapy, Psychotherapists, Clients, Counselling	Psychotherapy & Psychotherapeutic Counselling
Spain, Bédard, & Paiement (2004)	Semi-structured interviews followed by a 5-step systematic qualitative analysis	Qualitative	Career Development, Counselling, Counsellor Education, Occupational Guidance, Professional Development, Human Sex Differences	Men's Vocational Development, Men's Professional Paths, Counselling Interventions	Professional Education & Training
Buitenbos (2012)	Autoethnography, Narrative about therapeutic workshop for men	Qualitative	Group Counselling, Human Males, Verbal Communication, Ethnography, Masculinity	Autoethnography, Men, Counselling, Masculinity, Therapeutic Workshop, Group Setting, Vulnerable Dialogue	Group & Family Therapy
Grove (2012)	"Hermeneutic inquiry using conversational semistructured interviews"	Qualitative	Counselling, Individual Differences, Life Experiences, Major Depression, Self Management, Hermeneutics, Human Males, Treatment	Midlife Depressions, Counselling, Hermeneutic Inquiry, Male Perspectives & Experiences, Individual Differences, Depression Management	Affective Disorders; Psychotherapy & Psychotherapeutic Counselling
Kerner, Fitzpatrick, Rozworska, & Hutman (2012)	Case study using interviews, questionnaires, and participant drawings or written tasks	Qualitative	Career Education, Motivation, Group Intervention	Career Education, Group Intervention, Motivation, Career Exploration	Group & Family Therapy
Dmytro, Luft, Jenkins, Hoard, & Cameron (2013)	Grounded theory, Focused discussions, Audiotaped discussions were transcribed verbatim	Qualitative	N/A	N/A	N/A

(Table 5 continued on page 375)

Estefan & Roughley (2013)	Narrative inquiries	Qualitative	Homosexuality, Human Sex Differences, Narratives, Resilience (Psychological), Wisdom, Lesbianism, Male Homosexuality	Narrative Landscapes, Sexual Difference, Wisdom, Resilience, Same-Sex-Attracted	Personality Traits & Processes

Note. Information about Dmytro, Luft, Jenkins, Hoard, and Cameron (2013) was not provided on PsycINFO.

Table 6
Summary of Only Male, Empirical Research Study, Articles with Client/Student Samples

Author(s) (Year)	Results	Key findings/conclusions	Degree of generalizability/ transferability
Darou, Kurtness, & Hum (2000)	Overall, participants rated the quasi-experiment positively, the tests as "generally appropriate," and the experiment "fairly positively" in terms of Native values; most perceived the study as a pleasant activity. Ten of the 13 participants believed the research would have been better conducted by a Cree and three believed the research should not be conducted at all, though those three were from one of the villages that rejects psychological research.	Administering psychological tests was not a direct problem. Participants would prefer a Cree researcher to conduct the study than a non-Native because they believed a Cree would contribute more to the community than a non-Native would. Remaining flexible, open, and sensitive to cultural and personal values, collaborating with participants to interpret the research results, and contributing to the community are among the important aspects to address when conducting research with First Nations.	Low
De Stefano, Bernardelli, Stalikas, & Iwakabe (2001)	Most of the therapists' response modes included confrontation, interpretation, providing information, and information seeking. Confrontation and information seeking were viewed as a positive contribution to the counselling process. Providing information and information seeking were not seen as positive contributions. Therapist interventions that induce clients to take a stance, resolve discrepancies, and provide an explanation or simply to continue to respond to inquiry, information seeking and confrontation are associated with immediate indications of client change (asking intervention). Interventions where the therapist takes the stance of explaining, informing, or teaching are not associated with immediate indications of client change (telling intervention).	There may be two separate forms of interventions that result in varying therapeutic in-session processes, "asking" and "telling" interventions. Asking interventions are associated with immediate impacts. Telling interventions are not associated with immediate impacts. Therapist verbal response modes are useful in mapping out the structure of the therapist's activity.	Low

(Table 6 continued on page 376)

Author(s) (Year)	Results	Key findings/conclusions	Degree of generalizability/ transferability
Spain, Bédard, & Paiement (2004)	Participants completed the same work regardless of the number of employers when they had an education directed as one professional goal. Career development was primarily influenced by the internal dynamics of each participant. All of the participants experienced difficulty in orienting their desired career path as adolescents. This led to them all trying out many different jobs, some of which were not related, which impeded their goal to find the best job for them.	None of the participants had identical career paths which showcase how they were all influenced by their own personal desires, needs, values, and constraints. Career development was driven by an internal energy that drove professional choices.	Low
Buitenbos (2012)	"I examine the steps taken to create a safe and inclusive environment for participants and reflect upon and convey the challenges and benefits of counselling men in a group setting." "I observe that men are more likely to participate in a therapeutic dialogue with other men under certain conditions, notably an invitation from a trusted friend or therapist and testimonials from men who have participated in group work in the past."	"This approach of 'men helping men' can have lasting value for participants, leading to the development of close personal bonds with other men." It is important for men overcoming depression to acknowledge that what they are feeling is experienced by others. The ability to be honest with others aids in the ability to be honest with yourself.	Low
Grove (2012)	Learning how to manage depression through personalized strategies depended more on a trial-and-error basis than collaborative planning with a counsellor. When participants presented low self-awareness towards their mood, energy, and thoughts, it was more difficult for them to know what to do.	"Learning about depression triggers was predominantly accomplished learning by experience, reading self-help materials, and accessing the internet." "It seemed as though midlife presented a time of increased self-awareness and a willingness to seek out what was needed to manage depression and enhance the quality of life." It's important for men to know that there are different ways to go about dealing with depression in a counselling environment.	Low

(Table 6 continued on page 377)

Author(s) (Year)	Results	Key findings/conclusions	Degree of generalizability/ transferability
Kerner, Fitzpatrick, Rozworska, & Hutman (2012)	Satisfaction of needs for relatedness and competence were central components of engaging Bryan in career dialogue. Autonomous motivation stemmed from Bryan's feelings of relatedness between him and his peers and facilitator. It was important for Bryan to feel competent. Engagement in experiential activities, in which Bryan learned by doing, paired with dialogue around identity (and skills, in particular), facilitated his growth.	One is more likely to engage in self-exploration and career dialogue when their basic psychological needs are satisfied. When engaging at-risk youth in regard to career planning, it would be ideal to build a trusting relationship that focuses on equality and collaboration.	Low
Dmytro, Luft, Jenkins, Hoard, & Cameron (2013)	The boys wrestled with girls' expectations of them as boys and, further, struggled with how they wanted girls to act as well. The participants often felt that girls were in charge of the relationships instead of an equal partnership. The boys felt that girls were really mean (especially when it came to popularity) while boys did not care what others thought of them.	By understanding the perceived differences boys have of girls, it is possible to better assist boys' behavior to relate to girls and thus move boys beyond gender expectations. With more relatable behavior and understanding between boys and girls, healthier relationships can result.	Low
Estefan & Roughley (2013)	Before the construction job, Joseph saw himself as only a body and that his identity was a sexual being. The construction job was proof to him that he was not just his sexuality and that he was a man who could fit in with other men regardless of sexual orientation.	One form of resilience is the development of the belief that there is a normalness or naturalness to same-sex orientation. It is difficult to learn about oneself and there is no single, universal lesson to learn; it's an ongoing process that is unique to each individual.	Low

Note. Darou, Kurtness, and Hum (2000) had a low degree of generalizability for First Nations in general, but a high degree of generalizability for adult males of James Bay Cree of Quebec.

DISCUSSION

Discussions of gender frequently focus on the female gender role. However, men are also potently affected by gender expectations (i.e., gender norms) placed upon them and must navigate the gendered context of work, family, and the world as it is currently constructed. As such, the male gender role inevitably intersects with counselling and psychotherapy. The representation of males in research and scholarship published in CJCP since the year 2000 indicates considerable inattention paid to the male gender role. The pilot study (Hoover et al., 2012) showed a 12:1 ratio of intentionally female-focused to male-focused articles (research or nonresearch) represented in CJCP from 2000 to mid-2011 (via a scan of abstracts), and the present update (using more sophisticated methods) shows a 3:1 ratio. These numbers may not seem that troubling to some because the ratio of scholarship published is reasonably close to the percentage of males who are clients, and one may conclude that the situation is improving.

However, unpacking the data further presents a different picture. It seems that a very notable proportion of the articles on males were published in a single journal issue that was focused on the topic of counselling males. Without this journal issue, the ratio of female-focused articles to male-focused articles is 4:1 and the proportion of research on female-only samples to male-only samples is 6:1. As such, the situation seems somewhat worse but not dire. Nevertheless, some of the research samples that were solely or primarily composed of men did not purposefully consist of only males but were due to sampling error as a result of nonrandom convenience sampling (e.g., approaching an indigenous tribe for research and only being permitted to access males, or sampling from a location that had more males, such as a correctional facility). If we simply examine research studies that sampled only boys or men as part of the objective of their study, the ratio of intentional female-only research studies to intentional male-only research studies is increased to 6:1. If we further exclude the three research articles in the single special issue on males, the ratio of intentional female-only research to intentional male-only research is an astounding 15:1.

Temporarily disregarding the special issue on counselling males, which was published specifically to highlight the lack of scholarship on counselling boys and men, researchers who publish in CJCP are almost never providing research on male clients and are researching samples of women clients 15 times more than they are researching samples of male clients. Although the frequency of research on males has improved, almost exclusively because of the special issue, it is still a deprived area of study in CJCP. Given that males likely make up between 34% and 43% of all counselling clients (Khawaja, McCarthy, Braddock, & Dunne, 2013), they should be the topic of at least about 40% of gender-specific scholarship and research in CJCP. These results are troubling.

Based on our results, we speculate that many Canadian researchers and scholars who publish in CJCP are endorsing, implicitly or explicitly, nonsexist counselling—the idea that there should be equity and that clients should be treated as individuals, not men or women (Marecek & Kravetz, 1977). We speculate that

this is the basis for those many research studies that did not even separately list how many boys/men and girls/women are included (see the "Unknown" column in Table 2) and those who did not analyze the results of gender separately. In contrast to this gender-blind position, those that take a more gender-aware perspective (i.e., client concerns are best viewed within a sociogendered context; Good, Gilbert, & Scher, 1990) seem to concentrate their attention on the female gender role and its intersection with mental health, counselling, and psychotherapy.

It appears that much of our knowledge about counselling Canadians (at least that which has been published in CJCP) has been based upon research samples composed predominantly of women and has been somewhat uncritically generalized to working with men. However, research has shown that some therapeutic techniques that are usually effective with women do not always work as effectively with men, and vice versa (Schaub & Williams, 2007). For example, men in general may respond better to direct problem solving (Westwood & Black, 2012), bibliotherapy (Wisch, Mahalik, Hayes, & Nutt, 1995), skills development (Wisch et al., 1995), and practical help such as helping him with understanding his medication or micro-skills training to achieve a specific outcome (Bedi & Richards, 2011).

Even those actively seeking to develop greater male gender competence in their counselling or psychotherapy practice have a dearth of literature to draw upon. This can account for Westwood and Black's (2012) observation that counsellors, supervisors, and students with whom they are familiar "experience a sense of frustration, helplessness, and ineffectiveness when working with male clients" (p. 290). Therefore, in order to effectively serve boys and men and their mental health needs, further research and theorizing is necessary. This is not to say that girls, women, and female issues should not continue to be studied, but that there must be an improved balance, one that mirrors the gender representation of those seeking mental health services.

The generalizability/transferability (and thus justifiable basis to affect practice) of the few male-focused articles found in this study was arguably low. Many of the authors of these articles explicitly stated that their research was not generalizable, but this was apparent in the selected research design of others. As is not uncommon, there was a lack of replication for the few quantitative studies on males, which is needed to confidently apply the research to counselling practice.

The issues discussed above are not unique to Canadian scholarship and may represent a North American phenomenon, at least. A content analysis of the *Journal of Counseling and Development* from 1996 to 2006 (Blancher, Buboltz, & Soper, 2010) found that 42.2% of the reported research participants were male, although the authors remarked that 15% of studies did not state the gender breakdown of their samples. A content analysis of the *Journal of Counseling Psychology* from 1999 to 2009 (Buboltz, Deemer, & Hoffman, 2010) indicated that although on average 85.4% of research samples had at least one male participant over this 11-year span, in some years as few as 30% of studies had at least one male participant. Evans (2013) conducted the only comparable content analysis that we could locate that focused specifically on gender. She examined both the *Journal of Counseling and*

Development (JCD) and *Counselor Education and Supervision* (CES) from 1981 to 2011. She concluded that only 4.4% of the articles in the JCD had a focus on men in counselling, with the largest proportion of them occurring from 1986 to 1990. The results were even more dismal for CES: only 4 articles over the 11 years, totalling 0.5% of all articles, were focused on men. In sum, there is a dearth of literature investigating a very specific but sizeable cultural group—North American males, a group that can definitely benefit from psychological interventions.

Canadian males have higher rates of substance abuse, suicide, and sexual misconduct, and are more likely to be victims of violence than females (Hoover et al., 2012). Considering these points, it is alarming to know that males are also less likely to participate in counselling or psychotherapy, and that even when they do seek help, the dropout rate is substantial (Richards & Bedi, 2015). However, when remaining in counselling and being actively engaged in counselling or psychotherapy, men seem to benefit equally (Thase et al., 1994; Zlotnick, Shea, Pilkonis, Elkin, & Ryan, 1996).

Gender-sensitive service is required to keep many boys and men engaged in counselling. Some may question the shift to a greater focus on boys/men and male issues. For example, an editorial by Evans in the August 2010 issue of *Counseling Today* encouraging a greater focus on men in counselling was met with concerns about the existing male privilege (Evans, as cited in Evans, 2013). Her response was that "although men may hold higher paying jobs, are promoted faster, and hold male privilege, the research clearly shows this group expressing significant mental health needs that the profession of counselling needs to address" (Evans, 2013, p. 473). In not devoting sufficient research and theorizing on men and male issues in counselling, we are missing a very important group with unique needs, one that makes up nearly half of the Canadian population (Urquijo & Milan, 2011).

Though information is limited on recruitment methods specifically targeting men in counselling and psychotherapy research, there are articles addressing how to increase participation across different ethnic, cultural, socioeconomic, and age groups. Perhaps most important among the recommendations is training research recruiters to be more culturally sensitive and competent (for more strategies and information on recruiting ethnic minority populations, see Waheed, Hughes-Morley, Woodham, Allen, & Bower, 2015). In regard to recruiting men specifically, Butera (2006) found that the most effective strategy was talking about his research and asking for help from friends and colleagues; he asked them to speak to, for example, their brothers, fathers, male colleagues, and male friends who would be eligible participants and ask them to participate on his behalf. In other words, he proposed using one's own contacts (male and female) to help recruit men for research.

Butera (2006) noted that men tend to participate when there is a direct payoff (e.g., networking opportunities, career-enhancing benefits, monetary rewards), although they also participate when the benefits may come later, such as in research related to their work or about politics. Butera recommended having a male colleague's name on recruitment literature, being aware of gendered language, making sure the benefit of participating in the research is perceived as extrinsic, and appeal-

ing to individual characteristics, such as attracting by competition ("women were much better at volunteering their time than men"; Butera, 2006, p. 1277).

Spence and Oltmanns (2011) found that African American men, in particular, tended to participate more in research if they believed their input was valuable and the researchers were genuinely and respectfully interested in them as people. They proposed referring to the African American men by their surnames (unless given permission to use their first names) during recruitment calls as a way to be culturally sensitive, as is consistent with exhibiting great respect to elders, a culturally accepted practice in African American culture (Spence & Oltmanns, 2011). One study (Crombie et al., 2013) compared primary care (general practitioner recommendations) to a community outreach strategy (respondent-driven sampling), and suggested that using community outreach strategies to reach "hidden" populations for research was more effective. Information on encouraging more undergraduate males to participate in university sexuality research in particular is also available (see Dickinson, Adelson, & Owen, 2012), and some of that information could be relevant for recruiting boys and men for counselling research related to sexuality.

This article should not be construed as a critique of CJCP. Journals can only publish what is submitted to them. The main reasons that we are not seeing more scholarship on counselling males is, first and foremost, because such research is rarely being conducted and, second, when it is, it is not being submitted to CJCP. Thus, practitioners have limited resources for guiding their practice with boys and men. We wish to close this article by echoing the words of Westwood and Black: "The counselling profession is failing men" (2012, p. 286). We have written the current article "as a call to action in the service of men in Canada and abroad" (Westwood & Black, 2012, p. 285) and have provided objective information quantifying the neglect of counselling and psychotherapy research on boys, men, and masculinity in CJCP. Like them, we also hope that our article further stimulates conversations, research, and theorizing about counselling boys and men.

References

American Psychological Association. (2007). Guidelines for psychological practice with girls and women. *American Psychologist*, *62*, 949–979. doi:10.1037/0003-066X.62.9.949

Bedi, R. P., & Richards, M. (2011). What a man wants: The male perspective on therapeutic alliance formation. *Psychotherapy, 48,* 381–390. doi:10.1037/a00224424

Blancher, A. T., Buboltz, W. J., & Soper, B. (2010). Content analysis of the *Journal of Counseling & Development*: Volumes 74 to 84. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, *88*, 139–145. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6678.2010.tb00002.x

Brooks, G. R. (2010). *Beyond the crisis of masculinity: A transtheoretical model for male-friendly therapy*. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association. doi:10.1037/12073-000

Buboltz, W. J., Deemer, E., & Hoffmann, R. (2010). Content analysis of the *Journal of Counseling Psychology*: Buboltz, Miller, and Williams (1999) 11 years later. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, *57*, 368–375. doi:10.1037/a0020028

Butera, K. J. (2006). Manhunt: The challenge of enticing men to participate in a study on friendship. *Qualitative Inquiry*, *12*, 1262–1282. doi:10.1177/1077800406288634

Canadian Psychological Association. (2007). *Guidelines for ethical psychological practice with women*. Retrieved from http://www.cpa.ca/cpasite/userfiles/Documents/publications/guidelines%20for%20psychological%20practice%20women.pdf

Cox, D. W. (2014). Gender differences in professional consultation for a mental health concern: A Canadian population study. *Canadian Psychology 55*, 68–74. doi:10.1037/a0036296

Crombie, I. K., Falconer, D. W., Irvine, L., Norrie, J., Williams, B., & Slane, P. W. (2013). Risky single-occasion drinking and disadvantaged men: Will recruitment through primary care miss hazardous drinkers? *Alcoholism: Clinical and Experimental Research*, *37*, 1577–1581. doi:10.1111/acer.12123

Darou, W. G., Kurtness, J., & Hum, A. (2000). The impact of conducting research with a first nation. *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy*, *34*, 43–54.

Deering, C. G., & Gannon, E. J. (2005). Gender and psychotherapy with traditional men. *American Journal of Psychotherapy*, *59*, 351–360.

Dickinson, E. R., Adelson, J. L., & Owen, J. (2012). Gender balance, representativeness, and statistical power in sexuality research using undergraduate student samples. *Archives of Sexual Behavior*, *41*, 325–327. doi:10.1007/s10508-011-9887-1

Evans, M. P. (2013). Men in counseling: A content analysis of the *Journal of Counseling & Development* and *Counselor Education and Supervision* 1981–2011. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, *91*, 467–474. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6676.2013.00119.x

Finfgeld-Connett, D. (2014). Use of content analysis to conduct knowledge-building and theory-generating qualitative systematic reviews. *Qualitative Research*, *14*, 341–352. doi:10.1177/1468794113481790

Good, G. E., Gilbert, L. A., & Scher, M. (1990). Gender aware therapy: A synthesis of feminist therapy and knowledge about gender. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 68,* 376–380. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6676.1990.tb02514.x

Hoover, S. M., Bedi, R. P., & Beall, L. K. (2012). Frequency of scholarship on counselling males in the *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy*. *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy, 46,* 292–297.

Jorgensen, S., Fichten, C. S., Havel, A., Lamb, D., James, C., & Barile, M. (2005). Academic performance of college students with and without disabilities: An archival study. *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy, 39,* 101–117.

Karlin, B. E., Duffy, M., & Gleaves, D. H. (2008). Patterns and predictors of mental health service use and mental illness among older and younger adults in the United States. *Psychological Services*, *5*, 275–294. doi:10.1037/1541-1559.5.3.275

Khawaja, N. G., McCarthy, R., Braddock, V., & Dunne, M. (2013). Characteristics of culturally and linguistically diverse mental health clients. *Advances in Mental Health*, *11*, 172–187. doi:10.5172/jamh.2013.11.2.172

Marecek, J., & Kravetz, D. (1977). Women and mental health: A review of feminist change efforts. *Psychiatry, 40,* 323–329.

Ogrodniczuk, J. S. (2006). Men, women, and their outcome in psychotherapy. *Psychotherapy Research*, *16*, 453–462. doi:10.1080/10503300600590702

Owen, J., Wong, Y. J., & Rodolfa, E. (2009). Empirical search for psychotherapists' gender competence in psychotherapy. *Psychotherapy: Theory, Research, Practice, Training*, *46*, 448–458. doi:10.1037/a0017958

Palmer, R. S., & Daniluk, J. C. (2007). The perceived role of others in facilitating or impeding healing from substance abuse. *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy*, *41*, 199–212.

Ponsford, K. R., & Lapadat, J. C. (2001). Academically capable students who are failing in high school: Perceptions about achievement. *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy*, *35*, 137–156.

Reznicek-Parrado, J. (2013). *Strengths versus deficits: The impact of gender role conflict and counseling approach on the appeal of therapy for men* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Nebraska-Lincoln). Retrieved from http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1183&context=cehsdiss

Richards, M., & Bedi, R. P. (2015). Gaining perspective: How men describe incidents damaging the therapeutic alliance. *Psychology of Men & Masculinity, 16,* 170–182. doi:10.1037/a0036924

Schaub, M., & Williams, C. (2007). Examining the relations between masculine gender role conflict and men's expectations about counseling. *Psychology of Men and Masculinity*, *8*, 40–52. doi:10.1037/1524-9220.8.1.40

Sinacore, A. L., Park, J., Mikhail, A. M., & Wada, K. (2011). Falling through the cracks: Academic and career challenges faced by immigrant graduate students. *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy*, *45*, 168–187.

Spence, C. T., & Oltmanns, T. F. (2011). Recruitment of African American men: Overcoming challenges for an epidemiological study of personality and health. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology*, *17*, 377–380. doi:10.1037/a0024732

Sturgeon, R., & Morrissette, P. J. (2010). A qualitative analysis of suicide ideation among Manitoban farmers. *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy*, *44*, 191–207.

Thase, M. E., Reynolds, C. F., Frank, E., Simons, A. D., McGeary, J., Fasiczka, A. L., … Kupfer, D. J. (1994). Do depressed men and women respond similarly to cognitive behavior therapy? *The American Journal of Psychiatry*, *151*, 500–505. doi:10.1176/ajp.151.4.500

Urquijo, C. R., & Milan, A. (2011). *Women in Canada: A gender-based statistical report: Female population* (Statistics Canada Catalogue No. 89-503-X). Retrieved from www.statcan.gc.ca

Vessey, J. T., & Howard, K. I. (1993). Who seeks psychotherapy? *Psychotherapy: Theory, Research, Practice, Training*, *30*, 546–553. doi:10.1037/0033-3204.30.4.546

Waheed, W., Hughes-Morley, A., Woodham, A., Allen, G., & Bower, P. (2015). Overcoming barriers to recruiting ethnic minorities to mental health research: A typology of recruitment strategies. *BMC Psychiatry*, *15*, 1–11. doi:10.1186/s12888-015-0484-z

Westwood, M. J., & Black, T. G. (2012). Introduction to the special issue of the *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy*. *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy*, *46*, 285–291.

Wisch, A. F., Mahalik, J. R., Hayes, J. A., & Nutt, E. A. (1995). The impact of gender role conflict and counseling technique on psychological help seeking in men. *Sex Roles*, *33*, 77–89. doi:10.1007/BF01547936

Zlotnick, C., Shea, M. T., Pilkonis, P. A., Elkin, I., & Ryan, C. (1996). Gender, type of treatment, dysfunctional attitudes, social support, life events, and depressive symptoms over naturalistic follow-up. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, *153*, 1021–1027. doi:10.1176/ajp.153.8.1021

About the Authors

Robinder P. Bedi is an assistant professor of counselling psychology at the University of British Columbia. His main research interests include counselling/psychotherapy relationships, counselling/psychotherapy with men, professional issues in counselling psychology, and cross-cultural/multicultural counselling with Punjabi Sikh individuals. He also works part-time at Chuck Jung Associates, a group psychological independent practice that specializes in rehabilitation counselling.

Courtney N. Young recently graduated from Western Washington University with her BA in Psychology. She is in the process of applying to graduate school in the area of clinical mental health counselling. Her interests include substance abuse counselling and group counselling.

Jaleh A. Davari received her BA in psychology at Western Washington University and her MA in psychology from Gonzaga University. She is currently in the PhD program in the Department of Counseling and Psychological Services at Georgia State University.

Karen L. Springer is a MSc student in experimental psychology at Western Washington University. Her primary interests include psychotherapy, the therapeutic relationship, emotion regulation, developmental psychopathology, depression, and addiction recovery.

Daniel P. Kane graduated from Western Washington University with a BA in psychology. He is currently a MA student in marriage and family therapy at Seattle Pacific University.

Address correspondence to Robinder P. Bedi, PhD, UBC Department of Educational and Counselling Psychology, and Special Education, Vancouver, BC, Canada, V6T 1Z4. Email: Robinder.Bedi@ubc.ca