BOOK REVIEWS

BEYOND COUNSELING AND THERAPY


Reviewed by Justine Harris,
Graduate Studies,
University of British Columbia

Beyond Counseling and Therapy is remarkable. It looks at first glance like an indifferently printed textbook—overly busy format, cheap binding. Instead it is a compendium of ideas, arguments, and pleas ranging from savage to profound. Here are some of its features: the introduction of a comprehensive model for counseling and therapy; an assessment of the state of these “science arts” in recent years; critiques of the philosophies, strengths, and weaknesses of five major therapy systems; attacks on the influence of our sick society on individuals; a description of a new approach in directive therapy; an outline of the major dimensions for counselor-training programs; and abstracts of several relevant research studies. This is by no means all, but it’s enough to go on with. The authors are strongminded concerned men who are in a hurry—they are sometimes less than perfectly organized, often a whole lot less than perfectly serene—and they deserve our close attention.

Carkhuff and Berenson are convinced that our society—they are speaking of North America—does not provide “sources of human nourishment” for its members, and that persons in the helping professions function far less capably than they should and could. In fact, “If counselors and psychotherapists functioned in real life the way most of them do in the therapeutic hour, they would be patients” (p. 11).” (Wham!) As evidence for this extraordinary statement, they lean heavily on several of their research studies using their 5-point scale for measuring levels of therapist and client functioning. The scales rely on subjective ratings of interview tapes, and the authors acknowledge their limitations. From the examples they give of different interaction levels, however, one gets the drift of their method, and is willing to give them provisional benefit of the doubt. (Later in the book they use the ratings with perhaps undue precision, as when they recommend a certain counseling procedure only for clients performing at levels at or below 2.5.)

Given this sorry state of affairs in counseling and therapy, these authors are convinced that they have developed an approach to the training of counselors and therapists that may help to alleviate it. Their training program, however, is not the major subject of this volume (if it has a major subject, which is hard to say).

Having set the stage with their savage attack on present-day counseling, the authors take a look at theory. Here they are constructive, and present their thinking about theoretical dimensions. They posit four primary core
dimensions that facilitate effectiveness: empathy, respect, genuineness, and concreteness. These terms are discussed at some length, because they are not used exactly as other therapists have used them. The authors also posit secondary dimensions, which are “potential preferred modes of treatment.” The general shape of their model is a central blob with smaller blobs intersecting it around the edges: the central core dimensions must be present for effectiveness; the secondary dimensions are alternate choices which merge into the core. Choice of one or more of the alternatives depends on three variables: level of client functioning, level of therapist functioning, and context—roughly, the kind of problem the client has, or the kind of strength he wants to develop. The authors characterize their model as “an open, yet systematic, eclectic model (p. 228).”

The potential preferred modes of treatment are not limited to a prescribed or traditional few—these would be just a subset of potentially effective modes. But by way of illustration, and to make some emphatic side points about traditional counseling approaches, five currently dominant approaches are discussed in some detail: client-centered, existential, behavior modification, trait-and-factor, and psychoanalytic. The five chapters which treat these approaches are an island of organization in a choppy sea. They are written with verve and flourish and each includes an explanation of the approach, its contributions and limitations, and the conditions under which it might be expected to be effective. Some of this balanced fairness proves to be illusory, however, and the authors make no claim to objectivity—they think all five approaches lack universality of application. They do their best even with psychoanalysis, for which they list ten contributions, even though it is evident that they view this approach with the utmost distaste. (They include, as an appendix, a short article, “Psychoanalysis—A Process of De-vitalization,” by Raphael Vitalo—a roundhouse punch at the superego, delivered simultaneously with a bouquet to the id.)

Most interesting to this reviewer was the chapter on the behavior modification approach, which is treated in considerable detail and its potential usefulness with certain clients in certain situations underscored. In a list of “process contributions” for behavior modification, the authors include, for instance, the provision of clients with an understanding of the treatment process and his role, concrete awareness of his level of progress, and knowledge that the therapist is guided by client feedback (p. 94). On the limitation side, the authors note among other things that the “behavior modification approach drains the therapy experience of all creativity for the client (p. 97),” and that this approach “may be destructively employed by a sick society (p. 99).”

If there was any point in the book where this reviewer was inclined to wish that Carkhuff and Berenson would be less critical of the establishment, it was while reading the chapter on client-centered counseling. Here, after quoting for the most part from Rogers’s 1950 publications, they list as limitations of this approach that it does not provide “opportunity for the client to have an impact upon the therapist (p. 70),” “is unable to provide a vehicle for the therapist to give fully of himself (p. 71),” and the like. They even list, as a contribution, that the client-centered approach “keeps the unique and personal aspects of the therapist out of therapy”—a “contribu-
tion” because it “minimizes the potential destructive impact of some therapists (p. 70),” a comment that verges on being snide. It should be pointed out that Rogers has often, in the sixties at least, disavowed advocacy of faceless characterless therapists who engage solely in bland non-directive reflection. As an instance, he has written (1967) in a work Carkhuff and Berenson quote from in this chapter, that “the therapist is what he is during his encounter with his client. He is without front or facade, openly being the feelings and attitudes which at the moment are flowing in him. . . . (Rogers & Truax, 1967, p. 100).” As a coup de grace, the chapter heading for client-centered counseling in Beyond Counseling and Therapy is “Apparency in Search of a Person,” with the additional summary characterization of it as “. . . a highly verbal transaction, emphasizing words about feelings, rather than the more direct expression of feelings themselves between a self-denying, middle-class parent surrogate and his initiate (p. 63).” Amusing—even insightful—this may be, but it has a mean ring, as of an axe being ground in the middle distance.

After a brief excursion into disapproval, however, we can return with enthusiasm to the central section of the book in which an attempt is made to relate “construct to clinic.” This introduces the authors’ idea of two-phase therapy. Phase one is “downward,” self-exploration of the client; phase two is “upward,” “a period of emergent directionality (p. 141).” The authors think that most present-day therapy ends after phase one, and they plead with therapists to stop sitting around and endlessly exploring with clients, and to stop counting on insight and self-understanding to solve everything. Carkhuff and Berenson advocate directiveness by the therapist in this second phase, at least insofar as he gives direction to the process and, depending on client and context, possibly much more sharp and violent direction, to the point of inducing a crisis in the process. In this section, the ideas are absorbing and are well illustrated with quotations from therapy sessions. In this section, too, is a chapter called “Counseling as a Way of Life,” in which one finds the authors’ delineation of what a counselor must be—in Maslow’s terms he must be almost completely self-actualized—and a short section on counselor training that makes the reader want to study these ideas in expanded form.

The last section of the book is a restatement with variations, and includes a truly explosive polemic against society and its institutions, ending with the dictum that the counselor “must live independently of society (p. 225),” and “not feel bound by the notion that the counseling and therapy are dedicated solely to helping the individual to adjust to society (pp. 225-226).”

Three appendices include the article by Vitalo, previously mentioned; a complex proposal for an etiological equation, “a formal statement describing all classes of causal factors and indicating their relationships (p. 236),” by Frederick C. Thorne; and 21 abstracts of studies completed by the authors and their colleagues, most of them previously published in journals. This last is a useful addition for those who wish to study the book carefully, because Carkhuff and Berenson base much of their writing on this research. It would have been even more useful had they given page references to this appendix in the text so that the abstracts could be located more readily.
The most appropriate over-all adjective for *Beyond Counseling and Therapy* is “stimulating,” but this would smear the serious and instructive aspects with gloss. Despite the steamy excitement which they seem to operate with, and the uproar they will doubtless cause, they must be taken seriously. A few grains of salt are in order—Carkhuff and Berenson are neither the most careful nor the most methodical thinkers in the literature, and sometimes barbed phraseology takes over. Nevertheless, read it; you may need it sooner than you think.

**REFERENCE**


**INTANGIBLES IN COUNSELING**


Reviewed by Wes Penner, School Psychologist, Edmonton Public School Board.

There is increasing scientific evidence that man’s psychological well-being is profoundly affected by the degree to which he has found meaning in life, direction, and purpose in his existence. Insofar as they relate to counseling, C. Gratton Kemp, a psychologist-philosopher, has attempted to deal with these intangibles by assimilating and interpreting religion, philosophy, and psychology.

The content of the book has been cleverly woven into a systematic exposition: Section 1, “The Human Condition,” considers different concepts of man in terms of historical antecedents and the present complexity; Section II, “The Human Situation,” seeks to provide a framework in which to interpret various experiences and events of man’s life; and Section III, “The Human Processes,” deals with behavioral change as a developmental, continuous process which responds to external and internal energizers. Included at the end of each section are conclusions, implications, and stimulating questions.

The first section has the following sub-headings: Concepts of Man, The Self, Conscience, The Will, and Love. With regard to these sub-headings, Kemp points out that a counseling method has a direct relationship to the counselor’s beliefs regarding man; the self is variously defined and counselors often struggle with the meaning of it; conscience is a part of every counselee but its functioning varies widely from one person to another; the will is responsible for change in behavior and some counselors assume that the will asserts itself independently of the emotions or reason while others assume that the will is an integral part of the total self; although love is the most important quality of life, divergent viewpoints exist concerning its origin and nature.

In the second section, Modern Values, Anxiety, Freedom and Responsibility, and Search for Meaning are discussed. Kemp attempts to turn into constructive use some of the insecurities and personal crises which these